

# A Study on the Bio-Limiting Nutrient Circulation in the Ocean's Oxygen Minimum Zone

#### Grace A Abarike\*, Sibo Wang and Zhiguang Song

Department of Chemistry and Science, Guangdong Ocean University, Zhanjiang, China

\*Corresponding author: Grace A Abarike, Department of Chemistry and Science, Guangdong Ocean University, Zhanjiang, China, Tel : 15768447492; Email: abarikgrace4933@gmail.com

Received: 11-Sep-2019, Manuscript No. jmsrd-20-2399; Editor assigned: 16-Sep-2019, PreQC No. jmsrd-20-2399 (PQ); Reviewed: 30-Sep-2019, QC No jmsrd-20-2399; Revised: 25-Jul-2022 (R), QI No. jmsrd-20-2399; Manuscript No. jmsrd-20-2399; Published: 22-Aug-2022, DOI: 10.4172/2155-9910.1000350

Citation: Abarike GA, Wang S, Song Z (2022) A Study on the Bio-Limiting Nutrient Circulation in the Ocean's Oxygen Minimum Zone. J Mar Sci Res Dev 12: 516.

Copyright: © 2022 Abarike GA, et al. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.

### Abstract

The ocean's Oxygen Minimum Zone (OMZ) is known to be biogeochemical complex in terms of nutrient mass-balance and major element cycles. The recent reports suggesting that the ocean's OMZ facilitate about 25%-50% loss of nitrogen in the ocean predominantly by anammox coupled with the recent identification of the major contribution of DNRA to oceans  $NH_4^+$  flux, further complicates our understanding of the oceans nitrogen circulation and budget. Also, studies have shown that OMZ promotes the occurrence of sulfidic plumes. Moreover, the redox sensitivity of the ocean's OMZ such as their active sulfate reduction and sulfide oxidation potential makes them important regions for the cycling of phosphorus. However, as have been predicted that future expansion and intensification of OMZ driven by climatic change, still the understanding of this biological system remains a challenge with regards to its role in the overall chemical budget of the ocean.

In this regard, we aim to provide a comprehensive summary of the overall circulation patterns of some essential but biologically limiting nutrients such as nitrogen, sulfur and phosphorus in this OMZ of the ocean. This will benefit future researches on predicting global budgets of these nutrients and their cycles related to the marine environment as it will help bring out a good understanding of the inextricable link among each of these limiting nutrients, as have been researched and reported in varied ways.

**Keywords:** Bio-limiting nutrient; Nitrogen; Phosphorus; Sulfur; Oceans oxygen minimum zone

#### Introduction

Dissolved Oxygen Concentration (DOC) is one of the most important indexes for the thriving of marine ecosystems and a key factor in determining the energy direction in the marine trophic levels. DOC is equally the powerhouse for biogeochemical cycles, ocean nutrient circulation, biological production near the surface and the degradation of organic matter in the oceans interior [1-5]. However, certain layers especially the mid-layers of the present-day ocean is characterized by a low level of dissolved oxygen. DOC decline in the mid-layer of the water column arises when organic matter oxidization exceeds its availability in less ventilated zones, thus from a hypoxic layer commonly referred to as the Oxygen Minimum Zone (OMZ) [6-12]. This immerse recognition of the OMZ is as a result of its revealed expansion, intensity, and its role as a key to understanding the present unbalanced and altered nitrogen, carbon iron, phosphate cycle. The increase in hypoxic layers of the ocean is a direct consequence of global warming that causes the decline in oxygen solubility, concentration, and its vertical exchange in the ocean, thereby slowing down the oceans interior ventilation through propagated stratification [13,14]. As nitrate is depleted or used up, sulfate dominated reducing microbes assume, controlling the biogeochemical process involved in the cycling of marine sulfur. Also, hypoxia facilitates the greater recycling of Phosphorous (P), from sediments [15-20].

#### **Literature Review**

The oxygen minimum zone of the ocean occurring in mid-layer of the water column is hostile and inhabitable to metazoan life but is characterized by declined high trophic level diversity but abundant pelagic microfauna [21]. The microbial community in the OMZs possess assemblages of diverse genetic repertoire of putative sulfate, nitrate, and phosphate reducing bacteria whose combined metabolism plays intimate roles in its biogeochemical cycles and therefore which permits and enhances the use of alternative electron donors and acceptors during energy metabolism [22-30]. Specifically, OMZs are harbored by bacteria and archaea that arbitrate and facilitate the loss of oceanic fixed nitrogen to the atmosphere through denitrification and the recently discovered anaerobic oxidation of ammonia to  $N_2$  [31,32].

This review presents an overview of the cycling of some basic vital marine elements (nutrients) and how the overall declines in ocean oxygen concentrations affect their circulation, balance and availability in the ocean based on published reports [33]. It's hoped that the summarized information in this article would help improve our understanding of OMZ involvement in the circulation of these nutrients. This may facilitate a realistic assessment of the short and long term impacts of ocean de-oxygenation on the cycling of these

#### Bio-limiting nutrient circulation in the ocean's OMZ

The availability of bio-limiting nutrients such as nitrogen, phosphorus and sulfur other than H<sub>2</sub>O and carbon, are necessary supporting nutrients required for primary and biological production [41]. Biological limiting nutrients can be absorbed by primary producers via roots from the soil and in aquatic systems directly from solution/water to boast primary production. However, the availability of these essential nutrients in the ocean is threatened by the decline in DOC which has been observed to be facilitated by temperature increase [42-47]. In addition, observations from four modeled based assessment, it was shown that global warming caused declines in marine productivity at lower altitudes, suggesting that the recycling of these nutrients in marine environments is undoubtedly affected by stratification of the water column [43-55]. Nitrogen limitation affected primary production in Eastern Tropical North Atlantic (ETNA) and Eastern Tropical South Pacific (ETSP). Despite the numerous reports on the effects of global warming on nutrient circulation and marine productivity, there is still low confidence and insufficient measurement of the present and predictions of the future net primary productivity of the oceans [56,57]. Also, there is no clear distinction of climate induced signals on primary production and that of those resulting from natural variability as have been explained earlier [58-65].

#### Nitrogen circulation in the ocean's OMZ

Nitrogen plays a major role in the biogeochemistry of the marine environment with considerable influence on the cycling of other elements, particularly carbon and sulfur. However, the fluxes of nitrogen in the ocean is affected by the balance between ambient oxygen concentration which is determined by the O<sub>2</sub> supply and remineralization of sinking Particulate Organic Carbon (POC) [66,67]. In oxygen sufficient regions of the ocean, nitrification, a biologically enhanced process converts NH4<sup>+</sup> to NO2<sup>-</sup> and NO3<sup>-</sup>, whereas in anoxic ocean regions, nitrate, is generally known to be reduced in a stepwise manner to N<sub>2</sub>O or N<sub>2</sub> (2NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>  $\rightarrow$  2NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>  $\rightarrow$  2NO  $\rightarrow$  N<sub>2</sub>O  $\rightarrow$  N<sub>2</sub>) for the respiratory oxidation of organic matter [68-70]. Though, emphasized to be a hostile environment for almost all marine life, and cover about only about 7% of the oceans, global estimates show that the oceans Oxygen Minimum Zones (OMZs), promote about 25%-50% of the removal through anaerobic microbial activities especially anammox denitrification, of oceanic fixed nitrogen. Thus, OMZs are known to be the focal zones of oceanic nitrogen loss through denitrification and may cause lower nitrate concentrations in upwelled water [71-75]. Studies of the past geological records of sediments provides evidence of the important roles OMZ and coastal-offshore OMZ-water mass exchange play on the overall N budget. The role OMZs play in the nitrogen circulation especially its loss through heterotrophic and anammox denitrification has been evinced through several in-situ experiments. The diversified decadal measurement of the rate of nitrogen loss in the OMZ of oceans, employing methods, such as direct quantification of nitrogen gas, its ratios with Argon (N2:Ar), stoichiometric approaches and electron transport activity assays etc [76,77]. for areas such as those of the ETSP, ETNP and the Arabian sea are employed. However, none of these methods has been able to distinguish N<sub>2</sub> production resulting from anammox denitrification and that of heterotrophic denitrification. Also the rate and regulatory pattern involved in the production and release of  $N_2$  by each of these processes yet to be established [78-84].

Anammox denitrification is also known as bacterial oxidation of ammonium with nitrite under anoxic conditions (anammox) to produce N<sub>2</sub> (NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> + NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup> $\rightarrow$ N<sub>2</sub><sup>+</sup> 2H<sub>2</sub>O). During N-cycling processes, the substrates required for anammox denitrification, NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> and NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup> can be obtained from reduction of NO2 through heterotrophic denitrification processes and other possible sources such as nitrification (nitrate reduction to nitrite or the oxidation of NH<sub>3</sub>) and the oxidation of organic matter through Dissimilatory Nitrate Reduction to Ammonium (DNRA), (NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>/NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup> to NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>) and possibly excretion by zooplankton though remains to be established. Observations from the Peruvian and the Arabian Sea OMZs shows that NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> reduction significantly correlated with depth-integrated  $NO_2^-$  concentrations which suggests that that  $NO_3^-$  reduction is a major contributor to the secondary NO2-. Similarly, an annual estimation of about 51% and 65% of NO2<sup>-</sup> oxidation from coastal and offshore OMZ, respectively, of NO3<sup>-</sup> reduction of the ETSP was discovered. This observed occurrences, in the OMZs, suggests active N-loss in the ocean [85-92].

With the DNRA pathway, the anammox bacteria through multi haemnitrite reductase convert nitrates into nitrites and eventually to ammonium which is then combined with nitrite to form nitrogen gas. In early studies of the relative contributions of these process to marine nitrogen losses estimated through sealed sediments/water amended with 15N-labelled nitrogen species, DNRA was assumed to be insignificant compared with heterotrophic and anammox denitrification as anammox bacteria can also produce 15N15N from 15N nitrate, even in the absence of dissimilatory nitrate reducers [93,94]. The combined reactions of these reactants with anammox could be derived from the recovery of the label in the produced N<sub>2</sub> and may result in the production of a double 15N labeled N<sub>2</sub> (15N15N), which in recent studies is tagged to complicating the analysis of the data during isotope-pairing experiments. However, identified in the anoxic Peruvian shelf and upper slope sediments that, DNRA contributed up to 80% to the total benthic NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup> release as the major proportion of the total NO3<sup>-</sup> + NO2<sup>-</sup> uptake was routed into DNRA [95-98]. Likewise, DNRA at the shallowest station of the Peruvian contributed up about 63% (12.4 mmol m<sup>-2</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>) to the total  $NH_4^+$  flux. In OMZ off the coasts of Peru and Namibia, DNRA has been found to occur in regions where denitrification was not detectable but low rates of DNRA was detected, but also undetected in ETSP. However, the potential of DNRA to occur in open waters is still insufficiently explored and the distinction between the supply of NH4<sup>+</sup> and NO2<sup>-</sup> from DNRA and the other mentioned sources have not been extensively explored [99,100].

Aside the contributions of DNRA, nitrification etc. processes to the thrive of anammox denitrification in oceans OMZ, *ex-situ* sulfide incubation experiments within the Chilean OMZs suggest that cryptic sulfur cycling contributes about 30% of the of carbon mineralization and the subsequent release of  $NH_4^+$  for anammox. There has also been a recent discovery of as a potential niche for  $NO_2^-$  dependent n-damo, a methanotrophic and sulfate-dependent bacteria responsible for anaerobic oxidation of methane whose pathway reduces  $NO_2^-$  to Nitric Oxide (NO), which is then putatively dismutated into  $N_2$ . These imaging scenarios coupled with the predicted future expansions and intensification of the oceans OMZs, suggest that the future global losses of nitrogen may increase [101]. However, a confirmation of the potential for the activities of the n-damo in the pelagic OMZ and the

inclusion of these nitrogen loss contributing factors/activities in assessment of global nitrogen budgets is still lacking. Also, despite the significant effects nitrogen losses imprints in seawater nutrient, especially ratios of nitrogen to phosphorus and reduces the availability of nitrates for primary producers such as phytoplankton. However, these studies are still speculative, as biogeochemical models do not reproduce present-day global patterns of N [102,103]. Also, with the existence of OMZ in the oceans and its predicted vertical expansions in the near future in response to global warming we suggest the possibility of a growing and thriving mass of the denitrifying anammox bacteria, therefore we recommend further studies in other to determine the relative global distribution of this bacteria which is seldom studied [104-110].

#### Sulfur circulations in the ocean's OMZ

Regions of the oceans that are characterized by extreme hypoxia or worse cases of anoxia such as the OMZ of the ocean, facilitates the degradation of organic carbon leading to the production of Hydrogen Sulfide (H<sub>2</sub>S), from the heterotrophic mineralization of organic matter by giant Sulfate (SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup>) reducing bacteria. Under well balanced circumstances, such as a steady state where the diffusive fluxes of nitrate and sulfide are in a 1:2.5 ratio with sufficient concentrations O2, sulfide-oxidizing and nitrate-reducing these bacteria are capable of detoxifying sulfide into sulfur, preventing its release into the water column and reducing the frequent occurrence of sulfidic events [111]. On the other hand, in the oceans oxygen minimum zones, observed sulfide, a product of reduced sulfate often originates from sediments of nitrate and nitrite depleted waters that act as terminal electron acceptors for the oxidation of H<sub>2</sub>S as the reduction of NO<sub>3-</sub> and NO<sub>2-</sub> to  $NH_{4+}$  is accompanied by oxidation of dissolved Sulfide (H<sub>2</sub>S) to a Sulfate  $(SO_4^{2-})$  via elemental sulfur as a reactive intermediate [112]. Under these nitrate and oxygen deficient conditions, the accumulated concentration of sulfide reaches higher concentrations as it diffuses into the pelagic water column. In time series station in the Baltic Sea, a possible occurrence of frequent sulfidic plumes events which is likely to also occur in other eutrophication and OMZs hot zones such as the Atlantic and Pacific oceans. The massive Beggiatoa and Thioploca microbial communities harbored by the OMZ of the ocean e.g. OMZ sediments of the Arabian Sea, the Benguela current ecosystem off Namibia and that of the Basaltic sea etc. significantly reduce the sulfide flux from the sediments to the overlying water column. The quantified release of this toxic substance (H2S) especially from the underlying sediments into the water column can lead to the occasional build-up of high concentrations of H<sub>2</sub>S in bottom water e.g. diatomaceous sediments of Benguela current upwelling system and the SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2-</sup> reduction by pelagic microorganisms within the water column enhances its buildup in oceanic waters e.g. Black sea, promoting the loss in marine life and deterioration of the marine ecosystem at large [113]. Also under overextended conditions of declined bottom water Oxygen (O<sub>2</sub>), NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> and NO<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>, microbial sulfide production can overcome the sulfide oxidation capacity of the sulfur bacteria and lead to marine sulfide poisoning of life. In an attempt to determine the nitrate and nitrite concentration in the Peruvian OMZ discovered that, sediments had a high potential for sulfide release and began to release sulfide as soon as NO3<sup>-</sup> and NO2<sup>-</sup> become depleted. Furthermore the results from pore water geochemical and non-steady state model techniques employed by to determine how sediments with nitratestoring bacterial communities respond to NO3<sup>-</sup> and NO2<sup>-</sup> depletion, predicted an almost immediate increase in sulfide fluxes when NO3and  $NO_2^-$  where exhausted [114-118].

The metabolism of sulphur is considered primitive and genes related to its oxidation and reduction are dispersed throughout the bacterial and archaeal domains. Sulfur-oxidizing bacteria may be linked to that of the dissimilatory metabolism of oxidized nitrogen species as genomic analysis of the lineage SUP05, a free-living gammaproteobacteria relative of clam endosymbionts from the a North Pacific seasonal OMZ, revealed enzymes necessary for the chemolithotrophic oxidation of reduced sulfur, as well as those for nitrate reduction to nitrous oxide (N2O). Furthermore, the discovery of the bacteria, Epsilonproteo in the deep sea are thought of as being involved in the cycling of marine sulfur [119]. Advanced studies done, has shown that the bacteria Gamma may also be involved in the oxidizing of sulfur in the hypoxic marine water columns and both bacteria have an overlapping but slightly different distribution, potentially related to different redox potentials. Gammaproteobacteria were identified in the free nitrate-rich OMZ waters off the Chilean coast suggesting its involvement in the cycling of sulfur. Likewise, in sulfide-free but nitrate-rich regions of the Saanich Inlet, sulfideoxidizing and nitrate-reducing genes were found. Past studies have shown that the sulfur producing species have been reduced as they are predated and oxidized by heterotrophic, chemolithoautotrophic bacteria, reducing their threat to releasing hydrogen sulfide. However, a series of shipboard incubation experiments from current studies of waters obtained from OMZs demonstrates active sulfate reduction and sulfide oxidation. OMZ waters promotes pronounced sulfate reduction and likely responsible for substantial NH4+ production. However, concise evidence connecting sulfate reduction and NH4<sup>+</sup> production is still insufficiently explored [120].

Also oxygen, nitrate, nitrite, nitric oxide, and nitrous oxide utilizing and distinct chemolithoautotrophs,  $\gamma$ -,  $\delta$ - and  $\epsilon$ -proteobacterial taxa involved in the oxidation or reduction of sulfate in what they expressed as the largest plume ever recorded in oceanic waters, that occurred at the OMZ off Peru. This could be a consequence of the climate change accelerating temperatures and ocean stratification and subsequently facilitating the (H<sub>2</sub>S) production rate, however direct field observations are lacking. Likewise, the activities of the *Thioglobus perditus* together with free-living SUPO5 bacteria in the Peru upwelling and their dispersal facilitated by mesoscale eddydriven cross-shelf, was identified. However, the cell abundances, distribution, metabolic activities/capabilities of this free-living SUPO5 bacteria in the global ocean is still insufficiently explored [121].

The sulfur cycle has been proposed as a partial solution to the biogeochemical problem of closing marine fixed-nitrogen budgets in OMZs. However, the recent discovery of the cryptic sulfur cycling which refers to the simultaneous activity of sulfate-reducing and sulfide-oxidizing pathways in a closely defined space such as a marine particle aggregate, has been attributed to be contributing to the loss of fixed N from productive upwelling regions, the production of climaterelevant N2O and dark carbon fixation in the sub-euphotic water column. These reductions of the sulfate is said to only be active in the presence of thermodynamically fully utilized electron acceptors such as nitrate and nitrite, but some challenged this idea in their recent experiments suggesting that an active, but cryptic sulfur cycle is present in non-sulfidic subsurface waters in the eastern tropical South Pacific OMZ off northern Chile and concluded from outcome of their calculations, that sulfate reduction is still a thermodynamically favorable process in these OMZ waters. However, more studies on this should be done to rule out these speculations. Also, speculations of other OMZs of the global oceans, to be reservoirs of actively coupled sulfur and nitrogen cycles most especially the cryptic sulfur cycle

must be addressed for accurate global assessment of the balance of this nutrient in the ocean.

### Phosphorus circulation in the ocean's OMZ

Phosphogenesis is responsible for the removal of terrestrial phosphorus in the form of phosphate by intense weathering of sedimentary basins accumulated with phosphorous. Phosphate is one of the biogeochemical limiting nutrients whose existing percentage determines how much carbon is incorporated into the living biomass and how much is consumed during the growth of phytoplankton in the aquatic environment.

In the marine environment, phosphorus rapidly undergoes recycling in the water column but some organic components of it, stretches to the sediments especially under hypoxic conditions such as OMZ, as particulate organic matter such as phytodetritus, including those absorbed by iron oxyhydroxides and are later degraded at a certain depth, releasing  $HPO_4^2$ , limiting their sedimentary deposition. The sedimentary phases of Phosphorus (P) include but not limited to exchangeable P, Ferric Fe associated P, authigenic, biogenic and CaCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup> bound P, detrital P and organic P [122].

Under extended burial conditions, the labile P converted to HPO42and released from the sediments undergoes diffusions or precipitation as authigenic calcium phosphate minerals such as  $Ca5(PO_4)_{3.x}(CO_3)_x(OH,F)$ . These chemical forms of P in deposited sediments are a reflection of the redox and can be used to reconstruct the depositional conditions from sedimentary records. However, the burial efficiency of P is altered by the concentration of benthic oxygen, as it influences the reduction of the iron oxyhydroxides in reducing surface sediments, which decreases the capacity of the sediment to retain upward diffusing dissolved phosphate. It also alters the release of P from organic matter enhanced relative to carbon under reducing conditions.

Phosphates can be deposited as sedimentary rocks, formed from a series of biological actions coupled with mineral precipitations. Oceanic anoxic events play a major responsibility in the substantial deposition of phosphorite from the geological past, usually from preferentially regenerated from P-bearing organic matter as compared to carbon, such as black shale. Much of the regeneration takes place in the water column but in sediments of relatively shallow water bodies.

The decline in oceanic oxygen has a marked effect on the cycling of phosphorus as under hypoxic conditions, phosphate (TPO<sub>4</sub>) is dissolved and released into the pore fluids and subsequently into the overlying bottom water. Iron oxyhydroxides absorb this released phosphate and reduce them through microbial induced dissolution and the associated liberation of metal-oxide-bound phosphate, into absorbable states (soluble states), all enhanced under oxygen-deficient conditions. Hydrogen sulfide may then further enhance the phosphate released from the oxyhydroxides through reductive dissolution. Studies on the mechanisms of phosphorus cycling especially in the hypoxic region of the ocean are still insufficient, therefore, more laboratory, field, predictive future phosphorus flux models and assessment of the distribution of phosphorus using eg. remote sensing etc. shloud be done to build a comprehensive understanding of this component of our environment. Phosphogenesis is likely driven by large sulfur bacteria from the filamentous, highly motile genera Beggiatoa, Thioploca and non-motile Thiomargarita because of their marked frequent and large existence as fossils in phosphorite rocks in active regions of modern phosphorite formations. Likewise, the occurrence of phosphorus is also linked to the result of oversaturation in the pore water with respect to apatite induced by the activity of microorganisms such as large sulfur bacteria, *Thiomargarita*, and the phylogenetically and metabolically closely related genus *Beggiatoa*, that results in its precipitation.

#### Discussion

Dating back to 1986, the release of phosphorus upon the addition of sulfide which acted as a stimulant. In additions, they found out from their quest to ascertain whether "acetate or sulfide is responsible for the release of phosphate by a marine *Beggiatoa* strain through the decomposition of polyphosphates" that, phosphorite is formed preferentially in sediments with high sulfate reduction rates. Despite the discovery of the different sources and formation processes of phosphorite, a clear distinction of biologically available phosphorus and that of dissolved organic phosphorus from lateral fluxes and their significant potential transformation mechanisms, is still under discovered in hypoxic waters of the global ocean.

Regions of local upwelling, where sulfate reduction rates are exceptionally high are characterized by pronounced phosphogenesis as they are formed in shelf sediments that are located at the border of oxygen-depleted water masses. In occasions where bottom waters are oxygenated and nitrified, polyphosphate commonly referred to as poly-P and nitrates accumulated and stored in vacuoles Thiomargarita namibiensis, are speculated to be taken up during short periods. Consequently, when oxygen concentration drops to zero (anoxic), energy from the hydrolysis of the polyphosphate is gained by the Thiomargarita namibiensis. Anoxic bottom-water conditions coupled with regions where sedimentary iron cycling plays a major role in organic matter mineralization and also promotes the benthic regeneration and reflux of inorganic phosphate to the water column. Active phosphogenesis is mainly found beneath the nutrient-rich upwelling areas off the coasts of Peru, Chile and Namibia, in modern oceans, representing the major hotspots. However, during studies of microbial marine phosphorus cycle, the direct measurement of microbial phosphorus is difficult to achieve as for example, DNA sequences need to be measured directly or removed or its influence terminated during the DNA sequence analyses of diagnostic P-cycle but this practices is lacking. Also, the global assessment of the gains and the losses of phosphorus together with their distinctive loss pathways are still rarely if there is any, explored in the marine oxygenstarved regions.

## Conclusion

Climate-induced ocean oxygen declines and the predicted future further declines threaten the balanced distribution of the ocean biodiversity as it controls and alters the cycling patterns of basic biologically limiting nutrients such as sulfur, phosphorus, and nitrogen. The sensitivity of N loss processes in response to minimal changes in  $O_2$  potential for additional processes, such as preferential of sulfide and phosphate released directly in the water column drives the oceanic nutrient balance. The excess or limited production of these nutrients has a marked effect on the survival of the inhabitants of the marine environment and OMZ plays a major role in this.

However, global estimations of how much and at what rate sulfide is generated in the water column during a sulfidic event are not well resolved. Further investigation should be made to determine the distribution of these nutrient cycle altering organisms with depth and their specific niches. Also, the discovered combined effect of the eddy-driven cross-shelf transport and of *T. perditus* to denitrify and thrive on elemental sulfur in the absence of dissolved sulfide should be further investigated. Much attention should also be given to the uprising cryptic sulfur cycle, to ascertain if there are any associations with the cycling of the other limiting nutrients such as carbon, phosphorus, etc. since it is linked with nitrogen cycling that in turn, has the influence of other biochemical cycles. Furthermore, global assessment of the gains and the losses of phosphorus together with their distinctive loss pathways are still rarely if there is any, explored in the marine oxygen-starved regions (OMZ).

### Acknowledgments

The authors thank all colleagues in the department for their support in obtaining some literature to enrich this article.

## References

- 1. Albert DB, Taylor C, Martens CS (1995) Sulfate reduction rates and low molecular weight fatty acid concentrations in the water column and surficial sediments of the black sea. Deep Sea Res Oceano Res Papers 42: 1239-1260.
- 2. Bailey JV, Joye SB, Kalanetra KM, Flood BE (2007) Evidence of giant sulphur bacteria in neoproterozoic phosphorites. Nat 445: 198-201.
- 3. Benitez-Nelson CR (2000) The biogeochemical cycling of phosphorus in marine systems. Earth Sci Rev 51: 109-135.
- Bohlen L, Dale AW, Sommer S, Mosch T (2011) Benthic nitrogen cycling traversing the peruvian oxygen minimum zone. Geoch Cosmochi Acta 75: 6094-6111. ISME
- Bristow LA, Dalsgaard T, Tiano L, Mills DB (2016) Ammonium and nitrite oxidation at nanomolar oxygen concentrations in oxygen minimum zone waters. Proc Nat Aca Sci 113: 10601-10606.
- Brock J, Schulz-Vogt HN (2011) Sulfide induces phosphate release from polyphosphate in cultures of a marine Beggiatoa strain. The International Society of Microbial Ecology (ISME) J 5: 497-506.
- Bruchert V, Jorgensen BB, Neumann K, Riechmann D (2003) Regulation of bacterial sulfate reduction and hydrogen sulfide fluxes in the central Namibian coastal upwelling zone. Geoch Cosmochi Acta 67: 4505-4518.
- Burnett WC, Roe KK, Piper DZ (1983) Upwelling and phosphorite formation in the ocean. Coastal Upwel Sedim Rec 377-397.
- Callbeck CM, Lavik G, Ferdelman TG, Fuchs B (2018) Oxygen minimum zone cryptic sulfur cycling sustained by offshore transport of key sulfur oxidizing bacteria. Nat Com 9: 1.
- Canfield DE, Stewart FJ, Thamdrup B, De Brabandere L (2010) A cryptic sulfur cycle in oxygen-minimum-zone waters off the Chilean coast. Sci 330: 1375-1378.
- 11. Van Cappellen P, Ingall ED (1994) Benthic phosphorus regeneration, net primary production, and ocean anoxia: A model of the coupled marine biogeochemical cycles of carbon and phosphorus. Paleoceano 9: 677-692.
- Carolan MT, Smith JM, Beman JM (2015) Transcriptomic evidence for microbial sulfur cycling in the eastern tropical North Pacific oxygen minimum zone. Fron Microbiol 6: 334.
- Cassman N, Prieto-Davó A, Walsh K, Silva GG (2012) Oxygen minimum zones harbour novel viral communities with low diversity. Env Microbiol 14: 3043-3065.
- Cline JD, Richards FA (1972) Oxygen deficient conditions and nitrate reduction in the eastern tropical north pacific ocean 1. Limnol Oceanograp 17: 885-900.
- 15. Codispoti LA, Brandes JA, Christensen JP, Devol AH (2001) The oceanic fixed nitrogen and nitrous oxide budgets: Moving targets as we enter the anthropocene. Scientia Marina 65: 85-105.
- Codispoti LA, Christensen JP (1985) Nitrification, denitrification and nitrous oxide cycling in the eastern tropical South Pacific Ocean. Marine Chem 16: 277-300.

- Cole J (1996) Nitrate reduction to the ammonia by enteric bacteria: Redundancy or a strategy for survival during oxygen starvation. (FEMS) Federation of European Microbiological Socities Microbiol Letter 136: 1.
- Comeau Y, Hall KJ, Hancock RE, Oldham WK (1986) Biochemical model for enhanced biological phosphorus removal. Water Res 20: 1511-1521.
- Crosby CH, Bailey JV (2012) The role of microbes in the formation of modern and ancient phosphatic mineral deposits. Frontiers Microbiol 3: 241.
- Crosby SA, Millward GE, Butler EI, Turner DR (1984) Kinetics of phosphate adsorption by iron oxyhydroxides in aqueous systems. Estuarine Coastal Shelf Sci 19: 257-270.
- Dale AW, Sommer S, Lomnitz U, Bourbonnais A (2016) Biological nitrate transport in sediments on the Peruvian margin mitigates benthic sulfide emissions and drives pelagic N loss during stagnation events. Deep Sea Res Oceanogr Res Papers 112: 123-136.
- Dalsgaard T, Thamdrup B, Farías L, Revsbech NP (2012) Anammox and denitrification in the oxygen minimum zone of the Eastern South Pacific. Limnol Oceanogr 57: 1331-1346.
- 23. Dalsgaard T, Stewart FJ, Thamdrup B, De Brabandere L (2014) Oxygen at nanomolar levels reversibly suppresses process rates and gene expression in anammox and denitrification in the oxygen minimum zone off Northern Chile. M Bio 5: e01966-e01974.
- 24. Deutsch C, Brix H, Ito T, Frenzel H (2011) Climate-forced variability of ocean hypoxia. Sci 333: 336-339.
- 25. Devol AH, Uhlenhopp AG, Naqvi SW, Brandes JA (2006) Denitrification rates and excess nitrogen gas concentrations in the Arabian Sea oxygen deficient zone. Deep Sea Res Oceanogr Res Papers 53: 1533-1547.
- Diaz J, Ingall E, Benitez-Nelson C, Paterson D (2008) Marine polyphosphate: A key player in geologic phosphorus sequestration. Sci 320: 652-655.
- Dugdale RC, Goering JJ, Barber RT, Smith RL, et al. (1976) Denitrification and hydrogen sulfide in the Peru upwelling region during 1976. Deep Sea Res 24: 601-608.
- Falkowski PG, Algeo T, Codispoti L, Deutsch C, et al. (2011) Ocean deoxygenation: Past, present, and future. Eos Trans Am Geophys Union 92: 409-410.
- Falkowski PG, Fenchel T, Delong EF (2008) The microbial engines that drive earth's biogeochemical cycles. Sci 320: 1034-1039.
- Filippelli GM, Delaney ML (1992) Similar phosphorus fluxes in ancient phosphorite deposits and a modern phosphogenic environment. Geol 20: 709-712.
- Fisher TR, Carlson PR, Barber RT (1982) Sediment nutrient regeneration in three North Carolina estuaries. Estua Coastal Shelf Sci 14: 101-116.
- 32. Föllmi KB (1996) The phosphorus cycle, phosphogenesis and marine phosphate-rich deposits. Earth Sci Rev 40: 55-124.
- Fossing H, Gallardo VA, Jørgensen BB, Hüttel M (1995) Concentration and transport of nitrate by the mat-forming sulphur bacterium Thioploca. Nat 374: 713-715.
- Franz JM, Hauss H, Sommer U, Dittmar T (2012) Production, partitioning and stoichiometry of organic matter under variable nutrient supply during mesocosm experiments in the tropical Pacific and Atlantic Ocean. Biogeosci 9: 4629-4643.
- 35. Froelich P, Klinkhammer GP, Bender ML, Luedtke NA (1979) Early oxidation of organic matter in pelagic sediments of the eastern equatorial Atlantic: Suboxic diagenesis. Geochi Cosmo Acta 43: 1075-1090.
- Froelich PN, Bender ML, Luedtke NA, Heath GR (1982) The marine phosphorus cycle. Am J Sci 282: 474-511.
- Froelich PN (1988) Kinetic control of dissolved phosphate in natural rivers and estuaries: A primer on the phosphate buffer mechanism 1. Limnol Oceanogr 33: 649-668.
- Füssel J, Lam P, Lavik G, Jensen MM (2012) Nitrite oxidation in the Namibian oxygen minimum zone. (ISME) The International Society of Microbial Ecology J 6: 1200-1209.

Page 5 of 7

Citation: Abarike GA, Wang S, Song Z (2022) A Study on the Bio-Limiting Nutrient Circulation in the Ocean's Oxygen Minimum Zone. J Marine Res Sci 12: 350.

Ecology (ISME)

Page 6 of 7

- **39.** Füssel J (2014) Impacts and importance of ammonia-and nitrite oxidation in the marine nitrogen cycle.
- 40. Gnanadesikan A, Dunne JP, John J (2012) Understanding why the volume of suboxic waters does not increase over centuries of global warming in an earth system model. Biogeosci 9: 1159-1172.
- Goldhammer T, Brüchert V, Ferdelman TG, Zabel M (2010) Microbial sequestration of phosphorus in anoxic upwelling sediments. Nat Geosci 3: 557-561.
- 42. Van de Graaf AA, Mulder A, de Bruijn PE, Jetten MS (1995) Anaerobic oxidation of ammonium is a biologically mediated process. App Env Microbiol 61: 1246-1251.
- Groffman PM, Altabet MA, Böhlke H, Butterbach-Bahl K (2006) Methods for measuring denitrification: Diverse approaches to a difficult problem. Ecol App 16: 2091-2122.
- 44. Grote J, Schott T, Bruckner CG, Glöckner FO (2012) Genome and physiology of a model Epsilonproteo bacterium responsible for sulfide detoxification in marine oxygen depletion zones. Proc Nat Aca Sci 109: 506-510.
- 45. Gruber N (2008) The marine nitrogen cycle: Overview and challenges. Nitro Marine Env 2: 1-50.
- 46. Gutiérrez D, Enríquez E, Purca S, Quipúzcoa L (2008) Oxygenation episodes on the continental shelf of central Peru: Remote forcing and benthic ecosystem response. Progr Oceanogr 79: 177-189.
- Hamersley MR, Lavik G, Woebken D, Rattray JE (2007) Anaerobic ammonium oxidation in the Peruvian oxygen minimum zone. Limnol Oceanogr 52: 923-933.
- 48. Hawley AK, Brewer HM, Norbeck AD, Paša-Tolić L (2014) Metaproteomics reveals differential modes of metabolic coupling among ubiquitous oxygen minimum zone microbes. Proc Nat Aca Sci 111: 11395-11400.
- 49. Helm KP, Bindoff NL, Church JA (2011) Observed decreases in oxygen content of the global ocean. Geophys Res Letters 38.
- Henson SA, Sarmiento JL, Dunne JP, Bopp L, Lima I (2010) Detection of anthropogenic climate change in satellite records of ocean chlorophyll and productivity. Bio Geo Sci 7: 621-640.
- 51. Ingall E D, Bustin R M, Van Cappellen P (1993) Influence of water column anoxia on the burial and preservation of carbon and phosphorus in marine shales. Geochi Cosmo Acta 57: 303-316.
- Ingall E, Jahnke R (1994) Evidence for enhanced phosphorus regeneration from marine sediments overlain by oxygen depleted waters. Geochi Cosmo Acta 58: 2571-2575.
- Jensen HS, Mortensen PB, Andersen F0, Rasmussen E (1996) Phosphorus cycling in a coastal marine sediment, Aarhus Bay, Denmark. Oceanogr Literat Rev 4: 359.
- Jensen LJ, Kuhn M, Stark M, Chaffron S (2008) String 8-a global view on proteins and their functional interactions in 630 organisms. Nuc Acids Res 37: D412-D416.
- 55. Jensen MM, Lam P, Revsbech NP, Nagel B (2011) Intensive nitrogen loss over the Omani Shelf due to anammox coupled with dissimilatory nitrite reduction to ammonium. (ISME) The International Society of Microbial Ecology Nat Pub Group J 5: 1660.
- 56. Ji Q, Babbin AR, Jayakumar A, Oleynik S (2015) Nitrous oxide production by nitrification and denitrification in the Eastern Tropical South Pacific oxygen minimum zone. Geophy Res Letters Wiley Online Libr 42: 10-755.
- Jilbert T, Slomp CP, Gustafsson BG, Boer W (2011) Beyond the Fe-Predox connection: Preferential regeneration of phosphorus from organic matter as a key control on Baltic Sea nutrient cycles. Biogeosci 8: 1699-1722.
- Johnston DT, Gill BC, Masterson A, Beirne E (2014) Placing an upper limit on cryptic marine sulphur cycling. Nature 513: 530.
- Kalvelage T, Lavik G, Lam P, Contreras S (2013) Nitrogen cycling driven by organic matter export in the South Pacific oxygen minimum zone. Nat Geosci Nat Pub Group 6:228.
- Karl DM (2014) Microbially mediated transformations of phosphorus in the sea: New views of an old cycle. Ann Rev Mar Sci 6: 279-337.

- 61. Karstensen J, Stramma L, Visbeck M (2008) Oxygen minimum zones in the eastern tropical Atlantic and Pacific oceans. Progr Oceanogr 77: 331-350.
  (2) Key L, D, Key L, M, L, J, C, G, L, H, L (2007) Annual L, L (2007) Annua
  - 62. Kartal B, Kuypers MM, Lavik G, Schalk J (2007) Anammox bacteria disguised as denitrifiers: Nitrate reduction to dinitrogen gas *via* nitrite and ammonium. Env Microbiol 9: 635-642.
  - 63. Keeling RF, Körtzinger A, Gruber N (2010) Ocean deoxygenation in a warming world. Ann Rev Mar Sci 2: 199-229.
  - Kelly DP, Shergill JK, Lu WP, Wood AP (1997) Oxidative metabolism of inorganic sulfur compounds by bacteria. Anto Van Leeuwenhoek 71: 95-107.
  - 65. Killops VJ, Killops SD (2013) Introduction to organic geochemistry. John Wiley and Sons.
  - Konstantinidis KT, Rosselló-Móra R, Amann R (2017) Uncultivated microbes in need of their own taxonomy. (ISME) The International Society of Microbial Ecology J 11: 2399-2406.
  - 67. Kraal P, Slomp CP, Reed DC, Reichart GJ (2012) Sedimentary phosphorus and iron cycling in and below the oxygen minimum zone of the northern Arabian Sea. Biogeosci 9: 2603-2624.
  - 68. Kraal P, Bostick BC, Behrends T, Reichart GJ (2015) Characterization of phosphorus species in sediments from the Arabian Sea oxygen minimum zone: Combining sequential extractions and X-ray spectroscopy. Marine Chem 168: 1-8.
  - 69. Kraal P, Slomp CP, de Lange GJ (2010) Sedimentary organic carbon to phosphorus ratios as a redox proxy in quaternary records from the mediterranean. Chem Geo 277: 167-177.
  - Krajewski KP, Cappellen PV, Trichet JE, Kuhn OL (1994) Biological process andapatite formation in sedimentary environments. Eclogae Geol Helv 87: 701-746.
  - Kuypers MM, Lavik G, Woebken D, Schmid M (2005) Massive nitrogen loss from the Benguela upwelling system through anaerobic ammonium oxidation. Proc Nat Acad Sci 102: 6478-6483.
  - Labrenz M, Jost G, Pohl C, Beckmann S (2005) Impact of different *in vitro* electron donor/acceptor conditions on potential chemolithoautotrophic communities from marine pelagic redoxclines. Am Soc Microbiol 71: 6664-6672.
  - Lam P, Lavik G, Jensen MM, van de Vossenberg J (2009) Revising the nitrogen cycle in the peruvian oxygen minimum zone. Proc Nat Acad Sci 106: 4752-4757.
  - Lam P, Jensen MM, Kock A, Lettmann KA (2011) Origin and fate of the secondary nitrite maximum in the Arabian Sea. Biogeosciences (BG) Copernicus Publications 8: 1565-1577.
  - Lam P and Kuypers M M (2011) Microbial nitrogen cycling processes in oxygen minimum zones. Ann Rev Mar Sci 3: 317-345.
  - Lavik G, Stührmann T, Brüchert V, Van der Plas A (2009) Detoxification of sulphidic African shelf waters by blooming chemolithotrophs. Nat 457: 581.
  - Lennartz ST, Lehmann A, Herrford J, Malien F (2014) Long-term trends at the Boknis Eck time series station (Baltic Sea), 1957-2013: Does climate change counteract the decline in eutrophication? Biogeosci 11: 6323-6339.
  - 78. Lipschultz F, Wofsy SC, Ward BB, Codispoti LA (1990) Bacterial transformations of inorganic nitrogen in the oxygen-deficient waters of the Eastern Tropical South Pacific Ocean. Elsevier 37: 1513-1541.
  - Loescher CR, Bange HW, Schmitz RA, Callbeck CM (2016) Water column biogeochemistry of oxygen minimum zones in the eastern tropical North Atlantic and eastern tropical South Pacific oceans. Biogeo Sci 13: 3585-3606.
  - McManus J, Berelson WM, Coale KH, Johnson KS (1997) Phosphorus regeneration in continental margin sediments. Geochim Cosmochim Acta 61: 2891-2907.
  - Moore JK, Doney SC (2007) Iron availability limits the ocean nitrogen inventory stabilizing feedbacks between marine denitrification and nitrogen fixation. Global Biogeochem Cycles 21.

- Morrison JM, Codispoti LA, Smith SL, Wishner K (1999) The oxygen minimum zone in the Arabian Sea during 1995. Topical Stud Oceanogr 46: 1903-1931.
- Nakagawa S, Takai K, Inagaki F, Hirayama H (2005) Distribution, phylogenetic diversity and physiological characteristics of epsilonproteobacteria in a deep-sea hydrothermal field. Envi Microbiol 7: 1619-1632.
- Naqvi SWA (1987) Some aspects of the oxygen-deficient conditions and denitrification in the Arabian Sea. J Mar Res 45: 1049-1072.
- 85. Naqvi SW, Jayakumar DA, Narvekar PV, Naik H (2000) Increased marine production of  $N_2O$  due to the intensifying anoxia on the Indian continental shelf Nat 408: 346.
- 86. Naqvi SW, Naik H, Pratihary A, D'souza W (2006) Coastal *versus* openocean denitrification in the Arabian Sea. Eur Geosci Union.
- Noffke A, Hensen C, Sommer S, Scholz F (2012) Benthic iron and phosphorus fluxes across the peruvian oxygen minimum zone. Limnol Oceanogr 57: 851-867.
- Orcutt BN, Sylvan JB, Knab NJ, Edwards KJ (2011) Microbial ecology of the dark ocean above, at, and below the seafloor. Microbiol Mole Biol Rev 75: 361-422.
- Orsi W, Song YC, Hallam S, Edgcomb V (2012) Effect of oxygen minimum zone formation on communities of marine protists. Nat Pub Group 6: 1586.
- Oschlies A, Schulz KG, Riebesell U, Schmittner A (2008) Simulated 21st century's increase in oceanic suboxia by CO<sub>2</sub> enhanced in biotic carbon export. Global Biogeochem Cycles 22.
- 91. Padilla CC, Bristow LA, Sarode N, Garcia-Robledo E (2016) NC10 bacteria in marine oxygen minimum zones. Nat Pub Group 10: 2067.
- Paulmier A, Ruiz-Pino D (2009) Oxygen Minimum Zones (OMZs) in the modern ocean. Progr Oceanogr 80: 113-128.
- Piper DZ, Codispoti LA (1975) Marine phosphorite deposits and the nitrogen cycle. Am Ass Adv Sci 188: 15-18.
- 94. Redfield AC (1963) The influence of organisms on the composition of seawater. Sea Wiley Intersci 2: 26-77.
- 95. Reed DC, Slomp CP, Gustafsson BG (2011) Sedimentary phosphorus dynamics and the evolution of bottom-water hypoxia: A coupled benthic-pelagic model of a coastal system. Wiley Online Libr 56: 1075-1092.
- 96. Risgaard-Petersen N, Nielsen LP, Rysgaard S, Dalsgaard T (2003) Application of the isotope pairing technique in sediments where anammox and denitrification coexist. Wiley Online Libr 1: 63-73.
- 97. Ruttenberg KC, Berner RA (1993) Authigenic apatite formation and burial in sediments from non-upwelling, continental margin environments. Geochim Cosmochim Acta 57: 991-1007.
- Schmidt J (1925) On the contents of oxygen in the ocean on both sides of Panama Science. Am Ass Adv Sci 61: 592-593.
- Schulz HN, Brinkhoff T, Ferdelman TG, Mariné M (1999) Dense populations of a giant sulfur bacterium in Namibian shelf sediments. Am Ass Adv Sci 284: 493-495.
- 100. Schulz HN (2006) The genus Thiomargarita Prokaryotes 6: 1156-1163.
- Schulz HN, Schulz HD (2005) Large sulfur bacteria and the formation of phosphorite. Sci 307: 416-418.
- 102. Schunck H, Lavik G, Desai DK, Großkopf T (2013) Giant hydrogen sulfide plume in the oxygen minimum zone off Peru supports chemolithoautotrophy. PLoS One 8: e68661.

- 103. Simon, J (2002) Enzymology and bioenergetics of respiratory nitrite ammonification. Federation of European Microbiological Socities FEMS Microbiol Rev J 26: 285-309.
- 104. Somes CJ, Schmittner A, Galbraith ED, Lehmann MF (2010) Simulating the global distribution of nitrogen isotopes in the ocean. Global Biogeochem Cyc 24.
- 105. Sommer S, Gier J, Treude T, Lomnitz U (2016) 'Depletion of oxygen, nitrate and nitrite in the Peruvian oxygen minimum zone cause an imbalance of benthic nitrogen fluxes'. Deep Sea Res Oceanogr Res Papers Elsev 112: 113-122.
- 106. Steinacher M, Joos F, Frölicher TL, Bopp L (2010) 'Projected 21<sup>st</sup> century decrease in marine productivity: A multi-model analysis'. Biogeo Sci 7: 979-1005.
- 107. Stevens H, Ulloa O (2008) Bacterial diversity in the oxygen minimum zone of the eastern tropical South Pacific. Env Microbiol 10: 1244-1259.
- Stramma L, Johnson GC, Sprintall J, Mohrholz V (2008) Expanding oxygen-minimum zones in the tropical oceans. Sci 320: 655-658.
- 109. Suess E (1981) Phosphate regeneration from sediments of the Peru continental margin by dissolution of fish debris. Geochim Cosmochim Acta 45: 577-588.
- 110. Sundby B, Gobeil C, Silverberg N, Alfonso M (1992) The phosphorus cycle in coastal marine sediments. Limnol Oceanogr 37:1129-1145.
- 111. Takai K, Inagaki F, Nakagawa S, Hirayama H (2003) Isolation and phylogenetic diversity of members of previously uncultivated proteobacteria in deep-sea hydrothermal fields. Federation of European Microbiological Socities (FEMS) Microbiol Rev 218: 167-174.
- 112. Teske A (2010) Cryptic links in the ocean. Am Ass Adv Sci 330: 1326-1327.
- 113. Thamdrup B, Dalsgaard T, Jensen MM, Ulloa (2006) Anaerobic ammonium oxidation in the oxygen-deficient waters off Northern Chile. Limnol Oceanogr 51: 2145-2156.
- 114. Thamdrup B, Canfield DE (1996) Pathways of carbon oxidation in continental margin sediments off central Chile. Limnol Oceanogr 41: 1629-1650.
- Turchyn AV, Sivan O, Schrag DP (2006) Oxygen isotopic composition of sulfate in deep sea pore fluid: Evidence for rapid sulfur cycling. Geo Biol 4: 191-201.
- 116. Tyrrell T (1999) The relative influences of nitrogen and phosphorus on oceanic primary production. Nature 400: 523-531.
- 117. Vaquer-Sunyer R, Duarte CM (2008) Thresholds of hypoxia for marine biodiversity. Proc Natl Acad Sci 105: 15452-15457.
- 118. Wallmann K (2003) Feedbacks between oceanic redox states and marine productivity: A model perspective focused on benthic phosphorus cycling. Global Biogeochem Cy 17.
- 119. Walsh DA, Zaikova E, Howes CG, Song YC (2009) Metagenome of a versatile chemolithoautotroph from expanding oceanic dead zones. Am Ass Adv Sci 326: 578-582.
- Ward BB, Devol AH, Rich JJ, Chang BX (2009) Denitrification as the dominant nitrogen loss process in the Arabian Sea. Nat Pub Group 461: 78.
- 121. Whitney FA, Freeland HJ, Robert M (2007) Persistently declining oxygen levels in the interior waters of the eastern subarctic pacific. Prog Oceanogr 75: 179-199.
- 122. Wright JJ, Konwar KM, Hallam SJ (2012) Microbial ecology of expanding oxygen minimum zones. Nat Rev Microbiol 10: 381-394.